

A list of Working Papers on
the last pages

No. 126, 1984

**AN EASY FIXUP OF THE FLAW IN LUCAS'
"NEUTRALITY OF MONEY"**

by
Harald Lang

This is a preliminary paper. It is intended for private circulation, and should not be quoted or referred to in publications without permission of the author. Comments are welcome.

July 1984

AN EASY FIXUP OF THE FLAW IN LUCAS' "NEUTRALITY OF MONEY".

HARALD LANG*, the Industrial Institute for Economic and Social Research, Stockholm, Sweden.

The reader is assumed to be familiar with the papers |1| and |2|. The purpose of this note is to point out that the apparent flaw in |1| is very easily fixed.

All references are to |1|. The "error" consists of the fact that lemma 1 (p.111) does not seem to establish a one-to-one correspondence between p and x/θ . But it actually does, as the following proposition shows:

Proposition. Let $p(x,\theta)$ be defined and continuous for all (x,θ) in some open, convex subset of the first quadrant, and assume that

$$x_1/\theta_1 \neq x_0/\theta_0 \quad \text{implies} \quad p(x_1,\theta_1) \neq p(x_0,\theta_0)$$

Then the converse is also true, i.e.

$$p(x_1,\theta_1) \neq p(x_0,\theta_0) \quad \text{implies} \quad x_1/\theta_1 \neq x_0/\theta_0$$

Proof. Suppose the contrary, i.e. there exists (x_0,θ_0) and (x_1,θ_1) such that, say

$$p(x_1,\theta_1) > p(x_0,\theta_0) \quad \text{and} \quad x_1/\theta_1 = x_0/\theta_0$$

Note that this implies $(x_0,\theta_0) \neq (x_1,\theta_1)$. Now, by continuity, there exists (x'_1,θ'_1) close enough to (x_1,θ_1) such that $x'_1/\theta'_1 \neq x_1/\theta_1$ and $p(x'_1,\theta'_1) > p(x_0,\theta_0)$. Take next any real number p in the open interval determined by $p(x_0,\theta_0)$ and the minimum of $p(x_1,\theta_1)$ and of $p(x'_1,\theta'_1)$. Again by continuity, there exists (x',θ') in the open segment $((x_0,\theta_0), (x_1,\theta_1))$, and (x'',θ'') in the open segment $((x_0,\theta_0), (x'_1,\theta'_1))$ such that

$$p = p(x',\theta') = p(x'',\theta'')$$

Clearly, however,

$$x'/\theta' = x_0/\theta_0 \neq x''/\theta''$$

which contradicts the assumption of the proposition. Q.E.D.

* Mailing address: IUI, Grevgatan 34, 5tr., S-114 53 STOCKHOLM, SWEDEN.

One problem remains, however. The right hand side of Lucas' equation (4.2), being a conditional expectation, is a function of (x, θ) defined only almost everywhere. The definition of an equilibrium price function $p(\cdot)$ should thus be that (4.2) holds for almost every (x, θ) . The implication of this is that lemma 1 may fail to hold at points where the joint density of (x, θ) vanishes.

The easiest way to deal with this difficulty is to assume that the joint density function of (x, θ) is strictly positive on some open, convex set, and zero outside. E.g., if x and θ are independent, then each of them should have a density function which is strictly positive on some open interval and zero outside. Whether the uniqueness property of an equilibrium price function holds without any assumption on the density of (x, θ) remains, to my knowledge, an open question. We should finally remark, however, that in case $x=1$ (or $\theta=1$) with probability 1, the converse of Lucas' lemma 1 is immediate, and thus Lucas' theorems 2 and 3 remain true in all cases.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.

I am very much indebted to an anonymous referee for this Journal. First of all, he extended my proposition from the case in which $p(x, \theta)$ was assumed to be continuously differentiable. The proof given here is due to him. Furthermore, he pointed out the necessity to consider the density of (x, θ) .

Finally I wish to thank Bo Axell for introducing me to the papers |1| and |2|.

REFERENCES.

- |1| R.E. Lucas, Jr., Expectations and the Neutrality of Money. J. Econom. Theory 4 (1972), 103-124.
- |2| R.E. Lucas, Jr., Corrigendum. J. Econom. Theory 31 (1983), 197-199.

WORKING PAPERS (Missing numbers indicate publication elsewhere)

1976

1. Corporate and Personal Taxation and the Growing Firm
by Ulf Jakobsson
8. Estimation and Analysis with a WDI Production Function
by Göran Eriksson, Ulf Jakobsson and Leif Jansson

1977

15. Pay Differentials between Government and Private Sector
Employees in Sweden
by Siv Gustafsson

1980

25. On Unexplained Price Differences
by Bo Axell
34. Imperfect Information Equilibrium, Existence, Configuration
and Stability
by Bo Axell

1981

36. Energi, stabilitet och tillväxt i svensk ekonomi (Energy,
Stability and Growth in the Swedish Economy)
by Bengt-Christer Ysander
38. Utility in Local Government Budgeting
by Bengt-Christer Ysander
40. Wage Earners Funds and Rational Expectations
by Bo Axell
42. The Structure of the ISAC Model
by Leif Jansson, Tomas Nordström and Bengt-Christer
Ysander
43. An Econometric Model of Local Government and Budgeting
by Bengt-Christer Ysander
44. Local Authorities, Economic Stability and the Efficiency of
Fiscal Policy
by Tomas Nordström and Bengt-Christer Ysander
45. Growth, Exit and Entry of Firms
by Göran Eriksson

56. Central Control of the Local Government Sector in Sweden
by Richard Murray
59. Longitudinal Lessons from the Panel Study of Income
Dynamics
by Greg J. Duncan and James N. Morgan

1982

61. Var står den nationalekonomiska centralteorin idag?
av Bo Axell
63. General Search Market Equilibrium
by James W. Albrecht and Bo Axell
General Equilibrium without an Auctioneer
by James W. Albrecht, Bo Axell and Harald Lang
64. The Structure and Working of the ISAC Model
by Leif Jansson, Thomas Nordström and Bengt-Christer
Ysander
65. Comparative Advantage and Development Policy Twenty
Years Later
by Anne O. Krueger
67. Computable Multi-Country Models of Production
and Trade
by James M. Henderson
69. Relative Competitiveness of Foreign Subsidiary Operations
of a Multinational Company 1962-77
by Anders Grufman
71. Technology, Pricing and Investment in Telecommunications
by Tomas Pousette
72. The Micro Initialization of MOSES
by James W Albrecht and Thomas Lindberg
75. The MOSES Manual
by Fredrik Bergholm
76. Differential Patterns of Unemployment in Sweden
by Linda Leighton and Siv Gustafsson
77. Household Market and a Nonmarket Activities (HUS)
- A Pilot Study
by Anders Klevmarken

1983

79. Energy Prices, Industrial Structure and Choice of Technology; An International Comparison with Special Emphasis on the Cement Industry
by Bo Carlsson
81. ELIAS - A Model of Multisectoral Economic Growth in a Small Open Economy
by Lars Bergman
84. Monopoly and Allocative Efficiency with Stochastic Demand
by Tomas Pousette
86. The Micro (Firm) Foundations of Industrial Policy
by Gunnar Eliasson
87. Excessive Government Spending in the U.S.: Facts and Theories
by Edward M. Gramlich
88. Control of Local Authority Expenditure - The Use of Cash Limits
by Noel Hepworth
89. Fiscal Containment and Local Government Finance in the U.K.
by Peter Jackson
90. Fiscal Limitations: An Assessment of the U.S. Experience
by Wallace E. Oates
91. Pricing and Privatization of Public Services
by George E. Peterson
94. Job Mobility and Wage Growth: A Study of Selection Rules and Rewards
by Bertil Holmlund
96. The Machine Tool Industry - Problems and Prospects in an International Perspective
by Bo Carlsson
97. The Development and Use of Machine Tools in Historical Perspective
by Bo Carlsson
99. An Equilibrium Model of Search Unemployment
by James W. Albrecht and Bo Axell
100. Quit Behavior under Imperfect Information: Searching, Moving, Learning
by Bertil Holmlund and Harald Lang

102. Collecting Data for Micro Analysis.
Experiences from the Hus-Pilot Study
by N. Anders Klevmarcken
103. The Swedish Micro-to-Macro Model
- Idea, Design and Application
by Gunnar Eliasson
105. Estimation of Wage Gains and Welfare Gains from
Self-Selection Models
by Anders Björklund and Robert Moffitt
106. Public Policy Evaluation in Sweden
by Bengt-Christer Ysander
108. Entry, Industry Growth and the Microdynamics
of Industry Supply
by John C. Hause and Gunnar Du Rietz
109. Capitalist Organization and Nationalistic Response;
Social Dynamics in Age of Schumpeter
by William Parker
110. A Nonwalrasian Model of the Business Cycle
by J.-P. Benassy
111. Disequilibrium Economic Dynamics -
A Post-Schumpeterian Contribution
by Richard Day
112. Schumpeterian Competition in Alternative Technological
Regimes
by Sidney Winter
113. The Industrial Finance Systems; Europe, U.S. and Japan
by Tad Rybczynski
114. The Microeconomics of Organization and Productivity
Change - The Use of Machine Tools in Manufacturing
by Bo Carlsson
115. On the Behavioral and Rational Foundations of Economic
Theory
by Herbert Simon
116. Schumpeterian Dynamics
by Erik Dahmén
117. Micro Heterogeneity of Firms and the Stability of Industrial
Growth
by Gunnar Eliasson
118. The Initialization Process - The Moses Manual, Part 2
by Fredrik Bergholm

1984

119. Forestalling the Demise of Empirical Economics: The Role of Microdata in Labor Economics Research
by Frank Stafford
120. Unemployment and Mental Health - Some Evidence from Panel Data
by Anders Björklund
121. Comparative Keynesian Dynamics
by Richard H. Day
122. The Firm and Financial Markets in the Swedish Micro-to-macro model (MOSES)
- Theory, model and Verification
by Gunnar Eliasson
123. What Can Be Learned from the Chrysler Experience?
by Frank Stafford
125. Estimates of Bounds for Export Price Elasticities in an Underidentified Simultaneous Two Equation System
by Eva Christina Horwitz
126. An Easy Fixup of the Flaw in Lucas' "Neutrality of Money"
by Harald Lang
127. Comment on Feldstein and Poterba's "Unemployment Insurance and Reservation Wages"
by Harald Lang